

# EVROPSKA KULTURNA IDENTITETA. REALNOST ALI FIKCIJA?

MARJETKA GOLEŽ KAUČIČ

Vsaka nacionalna kultura je skupaj s svojo dediščino in izročilom danes opazovana v procesu izrazite dvojnosti – na eni strani so močno poudarjeni njena avtentičnost, izvirnost in specifičnost kot elementi posamičnih nacionalnih identitet, na drugi strani pa je močno vpeta v globalizacijske tokove in integracijske evropske procese, ki pa jo potiskajo v položaje, ko se odpira novim kulturnim dinamikam in vplivom ter tako vstopa v tiste prostore, ki jo povezujejo z drugimi evropskimi kulturnimi izročili.

Z željo po raziskovanju ustvarjanja identitete skupnega evropskega kulturnega prostora na vseh področjih kulture, tudi folklore, in po preseganju evropskih dediščin ter po tem, da bi etnologi in folkloristi našli nove vzvode za osvoboditev raziskovalne domišljije, je bil med 16. in 20. junijem 2008 v Derryju (Severna Irska) organiziran 9. kongres mednarodnega združenja za etnologijo in folkloro (Société d'Ethnologie et de Folklore – SIEF) z naslovom Preseganje evropskih dediščin – osvobojanje etnološke domišljije/ *Transcending 'European Heritages'. Liberating the Ethnological Imagination*. Potekal je v soorganizacijskem okviru Univerze v Ulstru (University of Ulster, Magee campus) in Akademije za irsko kulturno dediščino (Academy for Irish Cultural Heritages). Udeležilo se ga je več kot 400 strokovnjakov z vsega sveta, poleg devetih plenarnih predavanj in petnajstih delavnic ter drugih dogodkov je bilo še 43 sekcij (panelov), v njih pa se je zvrstilo različno število referentov.

Osrednja tema kongresa, s katero so se ukvarjali razpravljalci, je bila evropska dediščina kot resnična entiteta, nadnacionalni kulturni fenomen ali le umišljena realnost. Iskali so povezave med različnimi nacionalnimi dediščinami, hkrati pa so se ukvarjali z vprašanjem, ali gre v tem procesu tudi za zapuščenje okvirov evropske etnologije ter folkloristike in njunih raziskav ter za opazovanje tradicije in sodobnosti, dediščine in inovacij v etnologiji in folklori na nov način. In v tem morda poiskati skupno evropsko identiteto, ne politično, temveč kulturno identifikacijo s skupnim evropskim prostorom. Iskanje morebitnega skupnega jedra pa je bilo prepuščeno posamičnim panelom.<sup>1</sup>

Eden izmed panelov, ki ga je podprla Komisija za raziskovanje balad (Kommission für Volksliedforschung / Ballad Commission), panel s številko 270, in ga je vsebinsko in organizacijsko pripravila avtorica tega prispevka, se je ukvarjal z naslednjim vprašanjem:

<sup>1</sup> Gl. poročila o tem: Reports on the 9<sup>th</sup> SIEF Congress in Derry. *SIEF Newsletter* 7 (1) 2008/2009: 4–10; Ingrid Slavec Gradišnik, 9. kongres Mednarodnega združenja za etnologijo in folkloro (SIEF). (Derry, Severna Irska, 16.–20. junij 2008). *Traditiones* 37 (1) 2008: 201–204.

*Ali poznamo dediščino evropskih pesmi ali evropsko dediščino v pesmih?/ Is there a European heritage of songs or a European heritage in songs?* Tema, ki je ustvarila podlago za razmišljanje o odgovorih, je bila opisana in predstavljena takole:

*Tradicija ustvarjanja ljudskih pesmi, posebno balad, v različnih deželah Evrope je kazala kar nekaj skupnih značilnosti, še več pa različnosti. Morda je na to vplivala geografska in etnična raznolikost, različen zgodovinski in socialni razvoj, morda pa le drugačne ustvarjalne prvine, drugačni temelji folklore, ki so nato oblikovali pesemsko izročilo. O evropski baladi je razmišljal William James Entwistel (European Balladry, 1939), vendar v njegovi knjigi manjka kar nekaj narodov. Skupnih evropskih monografij ali zbirk ljudskih pesmi ni veliko, najbolj znani sta Werner Danckert, Das Europäische Volkslied iz leta 1939 in European Folk Ballads (ur. Erich Seemann, Dag Strömbäck in Bengt R. Jonsson), kjer je zajeta evropska pesemska tradicija. Zato v času krepitve EU, vstopanja novih članic v to skupnost, postavljamo naslednja vprašanja: ali je to Evropa narodov ali držav, kje so meje Evrope, kam sodijo evroazijski narodi, ali lahko ugotovljamo novo evropsko tradicijo ljudskih pesmi, pesmi posamičnih narodov in celo etničnih skupin? Ali imamo »evropsko pesemsko identiteto«, ali le nacionalno? Na kakšnih ravneh lahko opazujemo nacionalne specifičnosti in evropske univerzalnosti v ljudski pesmi? Ali je to vsebina pesmi (motivi, teme), besedilo pesmi, njegova oblika, melodija, njegov kontekst?*

Tu zdaj objavljamo niz šestih pogledov na kulturno povezanost Evrope na podlagi ljudskega pesemskega izročila v obliki šestih člankov, nastalih na podlagi prispevkov, ki so jih referenti predstavili 17. junija 2008 v Derryju in so se dotikali vprašanja o skupni evropski pesemski dediščini ali o tem, kako naj bi pesmi odsevale evropskost ali Evropo kot entiteto.

Avtorji in avtorice se teme lotevajo z različnih vidikov, bolj ali manj koherentno. Obdelava teme odseva povezavo dveh ali treh narodov, navadno sosednjih ali v isti jezikovni skupini. V posamičnih člankih so vključene skupne pesemske teme, forme, oblike, vsebine, celo morebitna skupna kulturna jedra, ki so poznana vsem. Tako npr. Marija Klobčar raziskuje božične pesmi in pesem »Sveta noč« kot pesem, ki je vstopila v vse nacionalne tradicije, Mari Sarv pa kitičnost ustvarjanja pesmi, prav tako najbolj razširjeno pesemsko oblikovanje, poznano po vsej Evropi.

Madis Arukask v članku z naslovom »Medžanrska prehajanja žalostink in ljudskih stopičnih pesmi epske pesnitve Kalevala v baltsko-finskem kulturnem prostoru« razmišlja o povezavi med baladami in obsmrtnicami (žalostinkami), ki naj bi imele posebno funkcijo v evropski dediščini, še posebno pri Estoncih, Fincih, Kareljcih in Setijcih idr., in o tem, kako naj bi prav obsmrtnice postale vsebinsko jedro zgodb za poznejše balade, kar lahko primerjalno povežemo s slovenskim položajem, ko ugotavljamo, da so prenekatere balade preživele prav zaradi tega, ker so bile v funkciji obsmrtnice in so se nato žanrsko prevrstile

v balade. Zanimiva je povezava pesmi »Na materinem grobu,« saj je po vsebinski strukturi neverjetno podobna slovenski družinski baladi »Sirota in mačeha,« ki jo najdemo še na Češkem, kar bi morda lahko kazalo na slovansko-baltsko navezavo.

Marjeta Pisk in Valentina Bold sta v svojih prispevkih povezali sosednja mejna naroda, Piskova dediščino pesmi, ki naj bi povezovala Slovence in Furlane (Italijane), Boldova pa vezi med pesemsko kulturo Irske in jugozahodne Škotske od 19. stoletja naprej. Piskova v članku »Folkloristika in predstavitev ljudske pesemske tradicije slovensko-furlanskega obmejnega območja« razmišlja o tem, da je povezava slovenske, furlanske in italijanske pesemske tradicije majhna. Njena trditev, da se kultura vedno ne prekriva z narodom, vsaj na mejnih območjih ne, je vprašljiva, saj je identiteta večinoma vezana na nacionalnost, in bi drugače težko opredelili posamično nacionalno dediščino, hkrati pa v obmejnih območjih folklorja prav zaradi relativne podobnosti njenih pojavov, postaja mnogo bolj fluidna kot drugod. Podobno prehajanje folklornih pojavov v pesmih Škotov in Ircev raziskuje Boldova v prispevku »Lahko, da je fant z Irske, a je govoril odlično škotsko, ko mi je dvoril. Pesemske povezave med Irsko in jugozahodno Škotsko.« Boldova je v pesmih našla tako navedke o pripadnikih irske in škotske nacionalnosti, o njihovih značajskih lastnostih, o podobnosti in različnosti med njimi, o potovanju podobnih vsebin med narodom in o potovanju resničnih ljudi z Irske na Škotsko in nasprotno, tako kakor jih odsevajo ljudske pesmi. Temeljno spoznanje prispevka pa je, da je podobnost med narodom zaradi njune bližine in medsebojnih vplivov zares velika in lahko govorimo o škotsko-irski pesemski tradiciji.

David Robb v članku »Skupna evropska pesemska tradicija Irske in Nemčije v 19. stoletju« išče nacionalno povezanost s pesemsko dediščino med nemškimi, škotskimi in irskimi političnimi pesmimi – temami in pristopi ter t. i. glasbeno sceno. Opozarja na močno navzočnost irskih skupin, ki so izvajale ljudsko glasbo v Nemčiji v 70. tih letih 20. stoletja, s tem pa prikaže tudi mnogo glasbenih in pesemskih vzporednic med sosednjimi narodi, nastalih na podlagi vpetosti v družbeni in politični kontekst poveljnega časa.

Mari Sarv se v članku »Verzne in kitične pesemske oblike v estonskem izročilu in v Evropi« osredinja na koncept ustvarjanja besedil pesmi v evropskem prostoru, in sicer o dveh metodah tega ustvarjanja: linearnem ali nekitičnem in kitičnem verzificiranju ljudskih pesmi. Linearno pesnjenje kot izvorni način ustvarjanja (kot celoten sistem) v baltsko-finskem prostoru je bilo sčasoma nadomeščeno s kitičnim, kar je po mnenju avtorice posledica sprememb v kulturnem kontekstu ter sprememb v družbi, ki so rezultat nekakšne evropeizacije estonskega naroda, posledica tega pa so bili vzpon individualnosti, večja pismenost, krščanstvo in rast nacionalne identitete.

Marija Klobčar v članku »Božične pesmi in oblikovanje istovetnosti« poveže ves evropski prostor s pesmimi, ki pojejo o božiču. Ugotavlja, kakšna je bila njihova percepcija v slovenskem prostoru v različnih zgodovinsko-političnih obdobjih, kako sta se prav z njimi v zavesti Slovencev povezovala Vzhod in Zahod, upošteva družbeno-politično ureditev, ki se je v zgodovini slovenskega naroda večkrat spreminjala. Obravnava tudi pesem »Sveta noč«, za katero meni, da je presenetljivo, da ni dobila statusa domače ljudske pesmi, čeprav je bila

v glasbeni spored sprejeta že sredi 19. stoletja. Četudi je njena razširjenost resnično izjemna, nikakor ne more postati ljudska pesem, saj iz nje niso nastajale različice, kar je eno izmed bistvenih meril definicije o ljudski pesmi. Je pa prav gotovo to pesem, ki presega nacionalne okvire, ne samo v Evropi, temveč po vsem svetu, kar je nedvomno rezultat globalizacije. S tem pa je najdeno skupno identifikacijsko jedro krščanskega sveta, s komercializacijo božiča pa se je pesem tudi sekularizirala.

Iz vseh teh medsebojnih interetničnih, vsebinskih, formalnih in drugih povezav, kakor jih raziskovalci razbirajo iz ljudske pesmi, lahko rečemo, da sta povezljivost in integracija kultur mogoči predvsem med sosednjimi narodi ali narodi, ki imajo podobno tradicijo (npr. Litva in Slovenija imata podobne tipe balad, a sta daleč narazen), Slovenija in Srbija, ki sta si geografsko mnogo bližji, pa imata popolnoma različni pesemski tradiciji. Torej more biti t. i. povezovalni faktor predvsem specifična etnij, hkrati pa tudi novi načini transformacij ljudskega, ki so podobni pri večini evropskih narodov. Ne glede na geografski in politični položaj posamičnih narodov pa je univerzalnost strukturnih in vsebinskih folklornih prvin različne folklorne tradicije v preteklosti že povezovala: v evropski folklori je prihajalo do izrazitega potovanja formul, verzni obrazcev, snovi in tem ter s tem duhovnega povezovanja evropskih tradicij. Evropska vpetost ni nova, univerzalne prvine folklore nas povezujejo od nekdaj. To pomeni, da je univerzalnost ljudskega lahko temelj integracije nacionalnih kultur. Še vedno pa je temeljno vprašanje, ali se kulturne specifične, značilne za vsak evropski narod, lahko povezujejo med seboj v skupne kulturne svetove in ti hkrati identitete ne asimilirajo, ali drugače: ali lahko imamo skupno evropsko kulturo, skupno evropsko pesemsko dediščino, v kateri so vidne in zaznavne različne etnije s svojimi kulturami, a hkrati v njih spoznamo skupno evropsko identiteto?

Odgovor, ki ga ponujamo, je naslednji: evropska kultura z njenimi dediščinami je sestavljena iz mozaika nacionalnih identitet, ki so še vedno zelo močne in neodvisne druga od druge, a imajo univerzalne skupne prenosljive vzorce, ki so v pesmih predvsem forme in vsebine, hkrati pa z močno in dinamično kulturno transformacijo evropska pesemsko dediščina (morda tudi evropska kultura) postaja entiteta, ki ni samo fiktivna, temveč počasi dobiva resnične poteze.

#### EUROPEAN CULTURAL IDENTITY: FACT OR FICTION?

Each national culture, along with its heritage and traditions, is undergoing a process of pronounced dualism today: on the one hand, its authenticity, originality, and specificity are firmly emphasized as elements of a particular national identity, but on the other hand it is also tightly integrated in globalization currents and European integration processes. These processes push the culture into positions of opening up to new cultural dynamics and influences, thus entering spheres that connect it with other European cultural traditions.

The ninth International Society for Ethnology and Folklore (SIEF) congress, held from 16 to 20 June 2008 in Derry, with the theme of “Transcending ‘European Heritages:’ Liberating the Ethnological Imagination,” aimed to explore the creation of a joint European cultural identity in all areas of culture, including folklore, to go beyond the frameworks of European heritage, and to find new strategies for unleashing researchers’ scholarly imaginations in ethnology and folklore studies. The congress was held at the University of Ulster Magee campus, hosted by its Academy for Irish Cultural Heritages. There were over 400 participants from around the world. In addition to nine plenary talks and fifteen workshops, among other events, there were 43 panels, offering varying numbers of papers on the given panel topics.

The central theme of the congress was European heritage, and the question of whether this is a real entity – a supernational cultural phenomenon – or just an imagined reality. The presenters sought connections between various national heritages, but at the same time they also dealt with the question of whether this process also represents the abandonment of traditional frameworks in European ethnology and folklore studies and a new way of studying tradition and contemporaneity – heritage and innovation – in ethnology and folklore. They also explored the possibility of finding a joint European identity in this; not a political one, but cultural identification with the common European community. The search for potential joint cores was left to particular panels.<sup>2</sup>

One of the panels (no. 270), supported by the Ballad Commission and for which I arranged the content and organization, occupied itself with the following question: “Is there a European heritage of songs or a European heritage in songs?” The topic, which opened up consideration of answers to the question, was described and presented as follows:

*The tradition of creating folk songs, especially ballads, within the various countries of Europe has shown many common characteristics, but even more differences. Perhaps geographical and ethnic diversity, various historical and social developments have had an influence on this, and perhaps even different creative elements and different foundations of folklore that then shaped the tradition of songs. William James Entwistle has written on the European ballad (European Balladry, 1939); many peoples are, however, missing from his book. There are only a few joint European monographs or collections of folk songs, the best known of which are Das Europäische Volkslied (Werner Danckert 1939) and European Folk Ballads (Erich Seemann, Dag Strömbäck, Bengt R. Jonsson, eds.), which cover the tradition of European songs. At this time of strengthening the EU and including new members in that community, we therefore pose the following questions:*

<sup>2</sup> See Reports on the 9<sup>th</sup> SIEF Congress in Derry. *SIEF Newsletter* 7 (1) 2008/2009: 4–10; Ingrid Slavec Gradišnik, 9. kongres Mednarodnega združenja za etnologijo in folkloro (SIEF). (Derry, Severna Irska, 16.–20. junij 2008). *Traditiones* 37 (1) 2008: 201–204.

*Is this a Europe of peoples or of states, where are the boundaries of Europe, where do the Eurasian peoples belong, can we distinguish a new European tradition of folk songs, songs of individual peoples or even of ethnic groups? Do we have a "European song identity" or just national ones? At what levels can we observe special national features and European universals in folk songs? Is it in the content of the song (motifs, themes), the text of the song, or its form, melody, or context?*

*Traditiones* is now publishing a set of six viewpoints on European cultural connections from the perspective of folksong heritage in the form of six articles stemming from papers given at the panel on 17 June 2008 in Derry. These papers touched on the question of a joint European song heritage or how songs reflect "Europeanness" or "Europe" as an entity.

The authors approached this topic from various perspectives in a relatively cohesive fashion. The papers dealt with connections between two or three different peoples, generally geographic neighbors or members of the same language family. Individual articles include common song themes, forms, contents, and entire potential joint cultural cores that are known to everyone (e.g., Marija Klobčar's article on Christmas songs and the song "Silent Night," which is a song that occurs in all national traditions, or Mari Sarv's contribution on stanzaic song forms, which are the most widespread form of song and are known throughout Europe).

In an article entitled "On the Inter-Genre Transitions of Laments and Kalevala-Metric Songs in the Balto-Finnic Cultural Space," Madis Arukask considers the connections between ballads and wake songs, which are thought to have had a special function in European culture, especially among Estonians, Finns, Karelians, and the Seto (etc.) people. The paper also discusses how wake songs in particular became the content core of narratives for later ballads, which can be comparatively linked with the Slovenian situation when one considers that quite a few ballads survived because they were used as wake songs and then later reclassified in the ballad genre. Arukask discusses a song called "On Mother's Grave," which presents interesting connections, because its content structure is unbelievably similar to the Slovenian family ballad "Sirota in mačeha" (The Orphan and the Stepmother), which is also found among the Czechs, which may point to a Balto-Slavic link.

The contributions by Marjeta Pisk and Valentina Bold both link two neighboring border peoples; Pisk's article discusses song heritage that connects Slovenians and Friulians, and Bold's discusses the links in the song cultures of Ireland and southwestern Scotland from the nineteenth century onward. In Pisk's "Folklore Studies and Presentations of Folksong Traditions in the Slovenian-Friulian Border Area," she considers the fact that there is little connection between the Slovenian, Friulian, and Italian song traditions. Her assertion that culture does not always correlate with ethnicity, at least in border areas, is questionable, because identity is usually connected with ethnicity and it would be difficult to define a particular national heritage otherwise, but at the same time folklore becomes much more

fluid in border areas than elsewhere, precisely because of its relatively similar phenomena. A similar transfer of folklore phenomena in the songs of the Scots and Irish is addressed by Bold in her article "An Irish Boy He May Well Be But He Spak Braid Scots When He Coortit Me: Song Connections between Ireland and South West Scotland." Bold looked to songs for references to people of Irish and Scottish heritage that mentioned their characteristics, and similarities and differences between them. She also looked at how similar content travelled between the two groups and also at the travels of real people from Ireland to Scotland and vice versa that were reflected in folksong. The basic conclusion of her article is that there is great similarity between the two groups due to geographical proximity and significant mutual influence, such that one can speak of a Scots-Irish song tradition.

In his article "A Common European Song Heritage in the Nineteenth Century Songs of Ireland and Germany," David Robb explored national connections in song heritage among German, Scottish, and Irish political songs. He looked at themes, approaches, and the "musical scene," determining that numerous Irish groups performed folk music in Germany during the 1970s. Robb thus demonstrated many musical and song parallels between neighboring peoples based on integration in the postwar social and political context.

Mari Sarv's article "Stichic and Stanzaic Poetic Form in Estonian Tradition and in Europe" focused on the concept of song lyric creation in Europe using the following two methods: the linear or non-stanzaic method, and the stanzaic versification of folk songs. As the original way of creating songs (as an entire system) in the Balto-Finnic region, linear song formation was gradually replaced by the stanzaic method. The author believes that this was a consequence of changes in the cultural context and social changes resulting from a sort of Europeanization of the Estonian people, leading to a rise of individualism, greater literacy, Christianity, and the growth of a national identity.

In her article "Christmas Songs and Constructing Identities," Marija Klobčar connects the entire area of Europe with songs about Christmas, discussing what their perception in Slovenia was during various historical and political periods and how these very songs connected the East and West in Slovenian consciousness, considering the social and political circumstances that underwent several changes throughout Slovenian history. She also deals with the song "Silent Night" and the odd fact that it did not attain the status of a domestic folk song, despite being accepted into the musical repertoire as early as the mid-nineteenth century. The song's universality is truly exceptional, but it was unable to become a folk song because variants never arose, which is one of the essential parameters of the definition of folksong. Nonetheless, it is precisely this song that transcends national borders not only in Europe but around the entire world, which is undoubtedly the result of globalization. It also reveals a core joint identity of the Christian world although with the commercialization of Christmas the song has also been secularized.

Based on all of these mutual interethnic, content, formal, and other connections found in folksong, one can assert that the connection and integration of cultures is possible primarily

among neighboring groups, or groups that have similar traditions: for example, Lithuania and Slovenia have similar ballad types despite being geographically distant, whereas Slovenia and Serbia, which are much closer to each other, have completely different song traditions. The “linking factor” must thus primarily be the features specific to the ethnic groups, but also new ways of culturally transforming folklore that are similar in most European nations. Irrespective of the geographic and political positions of particular nations, the universality of folklore elements’ structure and content in diverse folklore traditions also show past connections. European folklore saw a pronounced mobility of formulas, verse forms, content, and themes, forming conceptual links within European tradition. European integration is not new; universal folklore elements have connected us for ages. This means that the universality of the folk can form the basis of integrating national cultures. The basic question remains whether cultural particulars typical of each European nation can be linked with each other into a mutual cultural world without simultaneously have their identities assimilated. To put it another way: is it possible to have a joint European culture and joint European song heritage in which the diverse ethnic groups and their cultures are visible and recognizable, while still also recognizing a joint European identity?

The answer we offer here is the following: European culture and its heritage consist of a mosaic of national identities, which are still very distinct and independent of one another, but they have universal jointly transferrable patterns. In songs these are primarily form and content. At the same time, however, the powerful and dynamic cultural transformation of European song tradition (and perhaps European culture as well) is becoming an entity that is not only imaginary, but is gradually becoming a reality.

---

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Marjetka Golež Kaučič, Glasbenonarodopisni  
inštitut ZRC SAZU/Institute of Ethnomusicology SRC SASA,  
Novi trg 2, 1000 Ljubljana, Slovenia, marjetka.golez-kaucic@  
zrc-sazu.si